

5-2022

## Andy Stewart, Andy M. Stewart, and Exonostalgia: The Draw of Tartanry and Kailyard School

Sarah Tackitt  
*The University of Southern Mississippi*

Follow this and additional works at: [https://aquila.usm.edu/honors\\_theses](https://aquila.usm.edu/honors_theses)



Part of the [Ethnomusicology Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Tackitt, Sarah, "Andy Stewart, Andy M. Stewart, and Exonostalgia: The Draw of Tartanry and Kailyard School" (2022). *Honors Theses*. 824.

[https://aquila.usm.edu/honors\\_theses/824](https://aquila.usm.edu/honors_theses/824)

This Honors College Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Honors College at The Aquila Digital Community. It has been accepted for inclusion in Honors Theses by an authorized administrator of The Aquila Digital Community. For more information, please contact [Joshua.Cromwell@usm.edu](mailto:Joshua.Cromwell@usm.edu), [Jennie.Vance@usm.edu](mailto:Jennie.Vance@usm.edu).

Andy Stewart, Andy M. Stewart, and Exonostalgia:  
The Draw of Tartanry and Kailyard School

by

Sarah Tackitt

A Thesis  
Submitted to the Honors College of  
The University of Southern Mississippi  
in Partial Fulfillment  
of Honors Requirements

May 2022



Approved by:

Chris Goertzen

Christopher Goertzen, Ph.D., Thesis Advisor,  
School of Music

---

Colin McKenzie, D.M.A., Director,  
School of Music

---

Sabine Heinhorst, Ph.D., Dean  
Honors College

## ABSTRACT

Andy Stewart and Andy M. Stewart are popular Scottish folk and traditional musicians operating at different periods during the development of mass media. Andy Stewart's career was marked by the introduction of the television into Scotland, and he made his career being compère of the Scottish television show *The White Heather Club*. After gaining international recognition, viewers and listeners associated his tartanry and stereotypically Scottish humor as representative of his culture and country.

Andy M. Stewart gained international recognition during the folk revival, in which he wrote songs both for his solo career and for the band *Silly Wizard*. Aware of the romanticized perception of Scotland by the general public in and out of the country, Andy utilized kailyard in his songs to paint a picturesque image of Scotland and to draw in his listeners both through ingratiating sound and shared nostalgia.

The two romantic devices employed separately by the Stewarts – tartanry and kailyard – act as triggers to multiple types of nostalgia. This paper draws connections between these two devices and myriad types of nostalgia such as communal nostalgia, historical nostalgia, and exonostalgia. It explores the relationship of each type of nostalgia with the experience of both Scottish and non-Scottish listeners as they encounter these emotions.

**Keywords:** Andy Stewart, Nostalgia, Tartanry, Kailyard School, Silly Wizard, The White Heather Club

## **DEDICATION**

This thesis is dedicated to my family, particularly my parents Steve and Natalie Tackitt, for their steadfast belief in my success. Additionally, it is dedicated to Joseph Dunn who provided kind encouragement and a listening ear to my anxieties and struggles throughout this process.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The completion of this thesis would not have been possible without the expertise and dedicated guidance of my thesis advisor, Dr. Christopher Goertzen. His gentle encouragement and faithfulness despite my struggles throughout this process are greatly appreciated. The guidance and mentorship he has offered through my time in school has changed my life for the better. I owe him a deep sense of gratitude for his patience.

Additionally, I offer my thanks and encouragement to Bailee Green, a peer whom I have made this demanding journey with. She has kept me accountable yet has also been the voice of reason when this endeavor seemed impossible. I will forever be thankful for the conversations, misgivings, and triumphs we shared together as we made our way through this entire thesis writing process.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</u> .....	viii
<u>CHAPTER I: ANDY STEWART AND ANDY M. STEWART</u> .....	1
<u>Andy Stewart (1933-1993)</u> .....	4
<u>The White Heather Club</u> .....	6
<u>Popular Music</u> .....	9
<u>Andy M. Stewart (1952-2015)</u> .....	14
<u>Silly Wizard</u> .....	15
<u>Popular Music</u> .....	18
<u>CHAPTER II: EXONOSTALGIA</u> .....	21
<u>Exonostalgia Explored</u> .....	23
<u>CHAPTER III: TARTANRY AND KAILYARD SCHOOL</u> .....	32
<u>Tartanry and Andy Stewart</u> .....	32
<u>Kailyard School and Andy M. Stewart</u> .....	38
<u>REFERENCES</u> .....	44



## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BBC	British Broadcasting Corporation
TV	Television
UK	United Kingdom
US	United States

## CHAPTER I: ANDY STEWART AND ANDY M. STEWART

In the time following World War II, the contemporary folk music revival was underway. From Russia to Norway, people were rediscovering and appreciating the traditional music of their nations (Munro, 1991, 132-133). In Scotland, the dialect shift from Gaelic to English in the nineteenth century mirrored a repudiation of their traditional music. Ailie Munro, a folk music scholar, states:

*This cycle of rejection and later revival is found in possibly every field of human endeavor: it is part of the phenomenon of fashion in its widest sense. And the word 'revival' has a common denominator in whatever context it may appear: in particular, the rediscovery of old truths and arts, including the restatement and reshaping of these in modern terms plus commitment to the new movement. Thus, 'revival is an overt and explicit act of authentication' (133).*

In rediscovering their traditional music, these people also reshaped this music; they used new instruments, fit words to new tunes, or even changed some lyrics entirely to have this music fit a modern identity. Reintroduction of *ceilidhs*, a social event with sing, dancing, and storytelling, revived the folk scene and in 1953, nationalist poet and songwriter Morris Blythman opened the first folksong club in Scotland (134). At the beginning, the folk clubs tended to feature traditional songs from America, Russia, China, and Israel, but at the insistence of Ewan MacColl, pioneer of the British folk music revival, performances began to shift to songs sung in native tongues such as Scots, Irish, or English separate from American dialects (136).

To discuss the folk revival in Scotland and England without further delving into the contributions Ewan MacColl would be a great injustice to his importance to this

genre. Most heavily influenced by a family of Scots travelers of unclear national origin, MacColl consistently steered away from the romanticization of a rural life that many predeceasing and contemporary folk songs leaned towards (Samuel, 1990, p. 217). Instead, he focused on men living on the margins with characters such as fishermen, lorry-drivers, and various other types of laborers barely making do; he penned songs that considered the barbarity of life (217). An obituary which first appeared in the *Independent* described his music thusly:

*Ewan's art, like his politics, was impaled on impossible contradictions. He wanted to be true to 'tradition,' yet to have music made anew. He wanted to give voice to spontaneous, unmediated experience, yet also to serve radical causes. He loved the idea of free expression, yet he was immediately angered by anything which diminished the dignity of song. Despite his notional populism, he seems to have drawn back when one of his own creations began to capture the public imagination – the case first with Theatre Workshop and after with the folk clubs. Living in a period when the musicality of the British working class – or anyway of its young – was discovering an astonishing variety of new forms, he remained, like other socialists of his generation, deeply wary of anything which had been contaminated by commerce (221).*

In addition to writing his own music, Ewan MacColl collected hundreds of folk songs and reintroduced them to the general population. One such song is the popular dorian melody of *Scarborough Fair* which he collected from a miner in 1947 (Purslow, 1975; Garrido & Davidson, 2016). It is due to Ewan MacColl that many of these iconic folk songs are even known today, let alone popularized to the point that a person who

would not usually listen to folk music might recognize it. He expanded the reach of the folk genre significantly, making published collections of folk songs daily fare (Samuel, 1990, p. 221).

At the same time this folk song revival was happening in Europe, Americans were also delving into their own grassroots music. While Scottish music had already travelled to the United States along with Scottish and Scots-Irish immigrants to Virginia and the Carolinas during the 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> centuries, many songs had been molded and changed along the way, becoming just as American as they were Scottish (Carnahan, 2020).

American audiences after World War II were familiar with common Scottish songs such as “Auld Land Syne” and “A Wee Deoch an Doris,” but regarded these songs as foreign relics rather than essential parts of American music (Carnahan, 2020). Then, in the 1960s, American “folk” singers with scholarly bent began looking towards western Europe for their musical traditions and ideas. They rediscovered the musical settings of Scottish nationalist poems of Robert Burns; these were snatched up and Americans began finding Scottish ballads and traditional songs in their record bins (Carnahan, 2020).

This search and fascination for traditional music led many Scottish singers and performers to success in the United States and in other English-speaking countries, notably Australia, both through touring and with the help of radio and television. Scottish songs could be heard in every home and business that owned a radio or television. One such performer was Andy Stewart, who gained international recognition through the popular Scottish television show *The White Heather Club*. He was able to capitalize upon this widespread infatuation with Scottish and Celtic music in the 1960s, releasing many songs that were hits both in Scotland and internationally. A much younger singer-

songwriter, Andy M. Stewart, capitalized on the folk music revitalization about two decades after his name-fellow and achieved international recognition with both solo work and as a member of the popular Scottish folk band *Silly Wizard*. This paper compares how the two Stewarts portrayed Scottish culture during a time in which the mass media were changing, notably how they plumbed and nourished different wells in the always rich world of nostalgia.

### **Andy Stewart (1933-1993)**

In 1933, Andrew “Andy” Stewart was born in Glasgow to Andrew Stewart, a schoolteacher, and his wife Alice. Andy lived in Glasgow and Perth through age twelve when his family settled permanently in Arbroath, where the family already had a holiday home (Harris, 2012). While Andy’s parents and sister were musically gifted with instruments such as the violin and piano, Andy was known from an early age for his vocal dexterity. In fact, he found it “far easier to impersonate an instrument such as a trumpet with his voice than it was to actually learn to play it” (Harris, 2012).

Throughout World War II, Andy’s mother raised money for the Red Cross, and Andy sung at these events. At the same time, he was working on farms around Arbroath and hearing oral-tradition ‘bothy ballads’ sung by the farm hands (Harris, 2012). In his second year of high school, Andy would have one line in his school’s production of *No Hawkers*.

*He only had one line: “Would you be wantin’ ony safety pins, matches or pencils the day?” but it was enough. The stage bug had bitten and encouraged by two English teachers Bob Matthews and John Hutcheson, he and like-minded friends delighted in presenting a new play for the school each year including Andy taking*

*the parts of His Excellency Wang Yun, Prime Minister in Lady Precious Stream and Duncan MacCallum (Merchant & Small Sheep Farmer at Ardnish) in the one-act comedy Rory Aforesaid (A Sheepish Tale set in the West Highlands) by John Brandane (Harris, 2012).*

Andy Stewart attributes his desire to become an entertainer to his starring role in *Rory Aforesaid*, stating that “we got a lot of applause, and I just basked in it and decided that this was the life for me.” This led him to the Royal Scottish Academy of Music where he enrolled for a three-year course to become a professional actor; it was during his first year that Andy won a prize for comedy acting. A teacher told him: “You have a comical face which will take you far if you use it right” (Harris, 2012). He and a fellow student, John Cairney, were well-known at the Royal Scottish Academy of Music as comedians who endeavored to entertain their classmates. This act found its way into the local Silver Sands Café, where the boys were paid ten shillings each to perform a comedy and song routine (Harris, 2012).

In his last year of college, Andy won the First Prize for Comedy, First Prize in the BBC broadcasting competition, and the Silver Foil for Fencing along with his Diploma in Dramatic Art. His varied post-college jobs included appearances on the *Tommy Morgan Show*, touring alongside Duncan Macrae in *Gog and Magog*, and cultivating his nightclub act in *On The Tiles* at the Edinburgh Palladium theatre (Harris, 2012). However, the new medium of television was threatening theatres big and small and in 1955, Andy Stewart made his TV debut on the BBC broadcast *Garrison Theatre* (Harris, 2012), leading The Arbroath Herald to give a glowing review:

*There is no doubt that Andy Stewart stole the show. His freshness of approach,*

*and his comedy material provided a bright start. The Naval audience warmed to Mr Stewart's performance and gave him a great reception.*

*There was, it was generally felt, the necessary 'something for everybody' in his act: a few well-chosen, well-told stories, and a series of clever impressions based on the ditty *Ye Canny Shove Your Granny*. The impressions ranged from that of a wee Glasgow lassie, through an Olivier-esque oration on the theme, and a Captain (Charles Laughton) Bligh declamation, to a tearful modern rendering a-la Johnny Ray. It was a performance full of vigorous attack and mountain effect that quite overbowed the audience.*

*Andy Stewart's career takes a step forward and upwards with this appearance. It is the more particularly pleasing to his many local friends that so auspicious a debut should have been made at home.*

Due to this performance on *Garrison Theatre*, BBC contracted Andy for two years of TV appearances and had him present a new comedy music show called *Highland Fling*. *Highland Fling*, broadcast throughout Britain, became the fifteenth most watched program on British television and the highest rated BBC show (Harris, 2012). By the end of the 1950s, Andy Stewart was held in high enough esteem that he was invited to be part of the first *Royal Scottish Variety Performance* performed for Queen Elizabeth II and The Duke of Edinburgh; he performed alongside other Scottish virtuosos including Jack Anthony, Lonnie Donegan, Larry Marshall, The City of Glasgow Police Pipe Band, The Clyde Valley Stomper, and the Band of the Scots Guards (Harris, 2012).

### ***The White Heather Club***

As with every striking invention, the introduction of the television and commercial broadcasting did not come without its opponents. Efforts to make channels and broadcasting independent from the government struggled to make it through Parliament in Britain. During these inaugural years, 'The Toddlers' Truce' was introduced, and the hours channels were allowed to broadcast were limited. Specifically, the hours of 6:00pm to 7:00pm were to be empty of broadcasting so that parents could put their children to sleep without being distracted by the television (Livingstone & Bovill, 1999). It was after these restrictions were rescinded that radio show producer Iain MacFadyen took a course to learn about television and developed a new show format to fill the space that the BBC once had blocked (Harris, 2012).

Named after Robert Wilson's touring musical group, *The White Heather Club* was a popular Scottish television broadcast in the style of a ceilidh. Although hosted by Robert Wilson through the first year of its conception in 1958, Andy Stewart and *The White Heather Club* are synonymous to many. In fact, after it was discovered that the first show had been recorded on defective film, Andy Stewart was asked to fill in for Robert Wilson, who was performing internationally at the time (Williamson, 2021). Andy's guest appearance was so well-received that he was promised the hosting position should Robert Wilson ever leave. The *Glasgow Evening Times* contained a review stating that "The first edition of "White Heather Club" was bright and tuneful, and Andy Stewart became guest host in place of Robert Wilson. This is a show which could surely be put over on the national network instead of being confined to Scotland."

Before Andy was asked to take Robert Wilson's place as compere of the first episode of *The White Heather Club*, he was programmed to perform both songs, which



he had learned when he was working on farms as a teen. He accidentally fell into this role when the producer lamented to him that he could not find anyone who could sing these songs; he ‘auditioned’ in the bathroom of the BBC studio by singing *The Muchin’ O’ Geordie’s Byre* (Harris, 2012). The airing of both ballads on television had a remarkable impact; these songs were “more personal, realistic, and down to earth” ballads sung by farm servants particularly in north-eastern Scotland (Munro, 1997, p. 185). At the time these songs were created, farm servants were seen as a lower labor class. Many of their songs were written as protest songs in response to life and work, such as a master not paying them their wages or having poor living conditions (192). The integration of these “low-class” songs into the program of *The White Heather Club* put a spotlight on this previously obscure sub-genre of Scottish folk tunes, and they quickly became the backbone of the program; Andy Stewart personally valued these songs.

*They were ballads of the 19<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> centuries – and Burns. We became aware that we had an enormous heritage of traditional Scottish songs that people had never put on in theatres commercially before and The White Heather Club used these songs as the backbone of its material. We didn’t sing any Harry Lauder songs for example. We broke away from all that and put onstage what had been regarded as totally non-commercial. The lyric gems of Scotland became our bible more or less.*

It was during his time at *The White Heather Club* that Andy Stewart began donning a kilt during his performances. After wearing a suit for his first episode, Andy decided to sport a kilt and “started down the road as a ‘professional Scotsman’” (Harris, 2012). The tartanry of his performances is what he officially became known (and also

criticized) for, and his energy and talent brought *The White Heather Club* into favor; other regulars on the program spoke very highly of him, such as Joe Gordon stating “I think you can safely say, without Andy Stewart there wouldn’t have been a White Heather Club. Andy’s talent and his versatility and his monologues – and his sheer force of personality – kept the thing going” and Ian Powrie stating, “Andy Stewart *was* The White Heather Club.”

First broadcast mainly in Scotland, BBC recognized the popularity of *The White Heather Club* and made the decision to broadcast the program throughout Britain; this was a cost-effective way to fill half an hour since the show was already in production and pulling in many viewers (Harris, 2012). Giving *The White Heather Club* a larger stage proved to be a sound decision. At its peak, it would end up capturing ten million viewers. It was on this stage that Andy would premiere a song he had written the lyrics of himself that he called *A Scottish Soldier*. Positive response to this song was overwhelming, and the ensuing popularity brought Andy Stewart international recognition (Harris, 2012). Andy would eventually leave *The White Heather Club* to follow his solo career around the world but would return to guest-host the show a few various times in later years (Harris, 2012).

### ***Popular Music***

After signing a recording contract with the British label *Top Rank* in 1959, Andy released his first recording called *Donald, Where’s Your Troosers?* (Harris, 2012). This comedic, lighthearted song captured the attention of many. It would eventually become so well-known and beloved that the name of the piece would be used on hospital posters to encourage patients to dress themselves (Foster, 2022), and a minister would hear it

played while leaving a funeral (Caswell, 2012, p. 325). This song became a minor hit in the UK charts, peaking at number 37 there (Harris, 2012) and at number 1 in Canada (Kowal, 2007). When rereleased in 1989, it would reach number 4 in the UK (Jackson, 2017).

While the lyrics and setting of the song are distinctively Scottish, Andy Stewart also includes some cultural clash by singing a verse in the style of Elvis Presley and even subverts some typical, expected Scottish chord patterns. Mark Spicer, a specialist in analysis of popular music, says this of the song:

*The song sets up three positions, those of the Scottish yokel (who always wears a kilt), of polite (Edinburgh?) society, and (more hidden) of the (BBC) establishment of which Stewart was himself a part. Polite society is lampooned, and the yokel seems to come off best. However, the expressed distaste of rock'n'roll (the recording of the song itself contains a delightful pastiche of Elvis Presley singing it) is voiced on the part of the establishment. The song is harmonically accompanied by a 'double tonic' (i.e., Aeolian i-VII) pattern, which sounds authentically 'Scottish'. However, the end of each verse replaces the 'expected' VII-i cadence with the V-i of the concert hall – a subtle, but nonetheless forceful, trouncing of the Scottish vernacular with that of high culture. The harmonic environment, then, if we can hear it, tells us not to take the lyrics at face value (2017, p. 298-299).*

It is these bits of cultural friction and references that keep the song popular and relevant to this day; videos of it on YouTube have hundreds and thousands of views, with the most popular video entitled *Andy Stewart – Donald Wheres Your Troosers* posted by

user MqNachMan in 2012 has 1.4 million views. Additionally, the song was featured as a “detour” in the popular American reality television show *The Amazing Race* in January of 2022 when teams were invited to learn to sing, dance, and perform the song in full Scottish garb.

After recording *Donald, Where’s Your Troosers?*, Andy Stewart knew his next recording was to be *A Scottish Soldier*, which had already enjoyed repeat popularity on *The White Heather Club*. The reception of the record upon release was instantaneous and enthusiastic, and the tune spent forty consecutive weeks in the UK singles chart. This broke the record for the longest consecutive chart run without making the top ten, since it peaked at number 19 (Harris, 2012). Interestingly, the song can be interpreted in several ways. On the surface, it sounds like a romanticized story of a patriotic Scottish soldier defending his homeland and wanting to return home rather than dying in a foreign land; however, according to Andy Stewart, the soldier in the song was fighting for monetary gain rather than patriotism, stating “Also (regarding the “soldier”) I was really thinking of a mercenary soldier, somewhere around the 16<sup>th</sup> or 17<sup>th</sup> century, as part of the Scottish guard of the French Kings perhaps.”

It is not surprising, though, that many who heard this song would consider it imbued with nationalism and patriotism. Following the Second World War, many people were particularly proud of their homeland and those who had defended, fought, and died for it. Proud Scots were especially drawn to this song by Andy Stewart due to the melody he adopted – *The Green Hills of Tyrol*. This tune is known in Scotland mostly as a pipe-tune, and many traditionalists believed that Andy had ruined a “fine old Scottish pipe tune” by fitting words to it (Harris, 2012). However, this tune was not originally Scottish,

and Andy Stewart was aware of this when he penned his lyrics; he was privy to the true origin of this melody: “If those people had known the origins for the melody, they would probably have choked on their porridge. The tune is actually a traditional Swiss air heard in Sardinia and borrowed by a Scottish Pipe-Major during the Crimean War.” Andy chose this melody due to the sentimental ties he had to it, not due to its Scottishness.

*I had always known and loved ‘The Green Hills of Tyrol’ and the tune came to me. My father was a musician and played it on his fiddle and I remembered it from when I was knee-high to a grasshopper. It was one of the few things I could play as a boy on the mouth organ and I’d always had an ambition to write words to the tune. When I first began putting words to music, I was haunted by this tune and eventually inspiration came during rehearsals for ‘The White Heather Club’ (Harris, 2012).*

It could be oversimplified and considered that this song only became popular due to its blatant nationalism; after all, the sentimental tale of a patriotic Scottish soldier set to a well-known “Scottish” tune is easy to be proud of. However, this would not explain its considerable appeal in countries such as the United States, Canada, Australia, and many other countries. After the song’s popularity in the UK was firmly established, *A Scottish Soldier* was released in other English-speaking countries (Harris, 2012). The first of these countries was the United States. The song was quickly reviewed by the US music trade paper *Billboard*: “Andy Stewart sings of a Scottish Soldier with a Scotch burr in his voice on this lovely folk-styled tune. Tune is also called ‘Green Hills of Tyrol’. Listenable jockey wax (Harris, 2012).” *Billboard* issued another review four months later after

giving it three stars, stating “This tune, which is getting action on the Warwick label, receives a potent performance from Andy Stewart. Could get spins.” Following this last review, it entered the *Billboard Hot 100* at number ninety-four and would peak at number sixty-nine, spending twelve months on the US Billboard chart and becoming a top-fifty selling record for the US in 1961 (Harris, 2012).

In Canada, *A Scottish Soldier* topped charts at number one for three weeks until replaced by *Donald, Where’s Your Troosers*, making Andy Stewart one of four artists to ever replace themselves as number one in Canadian charts (Harris, 2012). Soon after that, in Australia, *A Scottish Soldier* would enter the charts at number five before making its way to number one; it was only knocked down to number two by Andy’s next single *The Battle’s O’er*. At one point, Andy had three records (*The Battle’s O’er*, *Donald Where’s Your Troosers*, and *A Scottish Soldier*) in the Australian top twenty (Harris, 2012). Nearby in New Zealand, *A Scottish Soldier* went straight to the charts at number ten before finally hitting number one a month later (Harris, 2012). Additionally, *A Scottish Soldier* “sold in Hong Kong, charted in South Africa, and was a top-five hit in India” (Harris, 2012).

The impact of *A Scottish Soldier* internationally is particularly important because Andy Stewart learned he would not have to change his locally popular image to be successful in other countries; his kilts and stereotypically Scottish performances would be welcomed and loved internationally. In fact, he would continue to perform his programs in unabashed full Scottishness and would unfailingly pack theatres and concert halls all the way until the night before his death due to health issues in 1993.

### **Andy M. Stewart (1952-2015)**

This opinion appeared in an article in *The Boston Globe*: “Andy M. Stewart is among the finest interpreters of Scottish Folk songs and a wonderful songwriter.” The authors further noted that throughout his career, Stewart used both traditional and modern instrumentation, making him more of a progressive folk musician than a solely traditional one (Uchida & Coppola, n.d.). However, traditionalists did not often criticize his revisions to melodies and lyrics, because Andy M. never identified himself as a pure traditionalist and would alter tunes to fit his needs and commentary (Sawyers, 1996, p. 62). After all, musicians working in oral tradition may revise at will. In the same vein, Andy M. refused to let himself fade into the background of the songs and stories he was telling like academics feel traditional ballad singers did; he would bring himself to the forefront through his “emotive and emotional presence” (Sawyers, 1996, p. 47). That too was a signal that he was drawing from both modern and traditional wells of creativity.

*Stewart is simply a musician, singer, and songwriter, “a wandering minstrel man” who makes a living by speaking with his music. His romantic heart remains a constant source of pleasure and joy for many, his voice both warm and reassuring. In a world that is increasingly hungry for roots, Stewart’s music makes a powerful emotional statement indeed (Sawyers, 1996, p. 62).*

Andrew M. “Andy” Stewart was born in 1952 to the prolifically musical Stewart family who were notorious for their traditional singing (“Andy M. Stewart”, 2016). While attending Blairgowrie High School, he met future musicians Dougie MacLean and Martin Hadden, and this group would play music together, taking inspiration not only from Scottish folk, but also Irish folk (Pollock, 2016). This small group known as

*Puddock's Well* would play at folk clubs around the Highlands (Hunt, 2016). Andy M.'s involvement in this group is what would eventually lead him to be invited to join the already established *Silly Wizard* as their vocalist (Pollock, 2016).

When *Silly Wizard* split in 1988 after members had decided the band had gone as far as they could take it, Andy M. began applying his talent to a solo career (Pollock, 2016). Popular songs such as *The Ramblin' Rover*, *The Queen of Argyll*, *The Valley of Strathmore*, and *Golden, Golden* touch on many nostalgic and romanticized topics such as a bucolic Scottish highland and, simply, romance (Sawyers, 1996). In addition to these songs, he also released several albums in collaboration with Manus Lunny, an Irish producer and multi-instrumentalist who was a member of the Gaelic band *Capercaillie* (Hunt, 2016).

### ***Silly Wizard***

The folk revival at the end of the 1960s gave many young traditionalist musicians hope that there was a prospect of turning their music into a career (McKerrell, 2011, p.1). It was in this hope that the band *Silly Wizard* was founded around 1970 by Gordon Jones and Bob Thomas who had met as students at Edinburgh University (“Silly Wizard Biography”, n.d.). The two played together at folk clubs in the area. Then, in 1969, Jones organized a folk music showcase while he was president of the Edinburgh University Folk Club; this led them to working with other musicians in the area (“Silly Wizard Biography”, n.d.).

It was in the early 70's that these two members, Bob Thomas and Gordon Jones, plus a revolving group of musicians whom they lived with had to decide on a name for their group so that the folk clubs where they performed could publicize their



performances; they settled on the nomer *Silly Wizard* based on a children's book that a friend of theirs was writing ("Silly Wizard Biography", n.d.). Soon after this, violinist and mandolinist Phil Cunningham joined the duo and created the first core "lineup" of the group; Gordon would be vocalist, guitarist, and would also play the Irish bodhrán drum and Thomas would play guitar, mandolin, and banjo ("Silly Wizard Biography", n.d.). Although young, this band made lasting impressions; as a group, they toured Scotland, played every Saturday night at the Triangle Folk Club, and even played internationally in France (Pollock, 2016).

For the next two years, *Silly Wizard* had a few more temporary members such as vocalist Madelaine Taylor and bassist Neil Adams, but it was not until 1974 that they invited a member who would become a permanent addition – Andy M. Stewart; this would create the second core line-up (Hunt, 2016). The group was looking for a more confident and established vocalist, and, since members had known and played with Andy's band *Puddock's Well*, they knew he would be able to take on this role (Pollock, 2016). Despite his upbringing exploring the contemporary genre of rock music, Andy chose to focus on folk and traditional music, creating his own synthesis; he would alter established pieces and write new pieces to bring traditional music into the present (Sawyers, 1996, p. 46).

Settling into the idea of "progressive folk" was furthered when *Silly Wizard* invited bassist Martin Hadden to join their line-up. At the time, Scottish traditionalists were not receptive to an electric instrument being used to play bass. Martin Hadden recalls "When I joined the Wizard... we went through that whole criticism... Ironically, at the end of the band, we were being seen as conservative in our electronics" ("Silly

Wizard Biography”, n.d.). Along with the bass, the band would intersperse other non-traditional instruments into their music such as synthesizer to supplement the regular acoustic instruments like banjo, fiddle, and even the piano-accordion (Hunt, 2016).

Despite the use of these contemporary instruments and ideas, the sound of *Silly Wizard* was still shaped by style of tradition. When *Silly Wizard* would perform, patrons would ask where they found this trove of unsung traditional music, and the band would inform them that they had written the songs (Hunt, 2016).

When Bob Thomas left the band to spend time with his family and with the final addition of Johnny Cunningham’s brother Phil on accordion and keyboard, *Silly Wizard* settled into the final line-up that became the most familiar (“Silly Wizard Biography”, n.d.).

*An engagement to play a modest show at Edinburgh’s Traverse Theatre in 1979 ended with the group being approached by an American booker – she got them 20 minutes on the bottom of the bill at that year’s Philadelphia Folk Festival, and the reception they received encouraged them towards a new level of international success. They were arguably more popular in the US and Europe – particularly Germany – than at home, playing 200 gigs in one year at the height of their success (Pollock, 2016).*

It is possible that international audiences, particularly America, were more welcoming of this progressive folk group due to the musical metamorphosis happening in their own countries simultaneously; traditional purists in Scotland were behind the times when it came to genre mixing in music, and they preferred for their familiar music to be performed unchanged and as the spotlight of the show. However, popular stand-out

performers in the 1970s such as Led Zeppelin and particularly Elton John meant electric instruments in traditional folk music did not warrant the blink of an eye to the average music enjoyer. Their international popularity and success meant *Silly Wizard*, and especially Andy M. Stewart, could experiment vocally, instrumentally, and lyrically with contemporary ideas as much as they needed to in order to convey their ideas through the traditional style. Original member Gordon Jones summarizes this well – “Taking the music, still being respectful for it, and making it accessible to our generation: The whole point being that you play in the tradition. I don’t think you want to mess around with it too much. You want to play it for now, but not change it” (“Silly Wizard Biography”, n.d.).

In 1988, the group of musicians decided to dissolve the band. They performed their last concert in Vorheesville, New York (“Silly Wizard Biography”, n.d.). It was not due to poor reception that they ended their time as a band but the stress of touring; none of the members regretted leaving off where they did, and each individual remained in the entertainment career after *Silly Wizard*’s dissolution (“Silly Wizard Biography”, n.d.). Andy M. Stewart said, “When we sang our last song, there was no doubt on anyone’s mind that that was the end. We did the biggest tour ever, and we had the most fun ever, and then we walked away from it.”

### ***Popular Music***

During his solo career, Andy M. Stewart was just as successful as he was when he was frontman of *Silly Wizard*. He continued to write his progressive folk songs and was particularly gripping with his romantic songs; he himself once sang “I am a wandering minstrel man, and love is my only theme” (Sawyers, 1996, p. 46). Contrary to this lyric,

Stewart, of course did not sing only of unrequited love; although his repertoire leaned heavily in that direction, he also sang Jacobite songs, both ballads, and political anti-war songs (Sawyers, 1996, p. 47).

Three popular love songs written by Andy are “Golden, Golden,” “The Valley of Strathmore,” and “The Queen of Argyll.” Interestingly, while Andy M. Stewart wrote far more love songs with negative themes, some of his more popular songs are his positive love songs. Two such positive songs are “Golden, Golden” and “Queen of Argyll” and a cynical song telling a tale of separation is “The Valley of Strathmore” (Sawyers, 1996, p. 48). Throughout his music and particularly in his love songs, Andy spun a romanticized, bucolic picture of the Scottish highlands. These images captivated his audiences, particularly those used to only the stereotyped depiction of the country through media such as movies, literature, and other music.

Andy M. Stewart’s interpretations of classic Robert Burns songs were also well-received. Andy took a lot of inspiration from Burns’ lyrics and poems when penning his own songs, and when performing Robert’s pieces, he stayed true to the sentiments being conveyed.

*It must be said that Burns did more than anyone before him to convey an authentic portrait of Scotland and its culture. Burns could express emotional truths while allowing a bit of poetic license to creep into his work. Similarly, Stewart emulates the honest emotion of a Robert Burns in the bittersweet bothy ballad, “Bogie’s Bonnie Bell,” which states its story of an ill-fated romance that ends in an out-of-wedlock birth simply, without remorse or guilt. Perhaps,*

*though, the spirit of Burns is best personified in the sheer physical vitality and randy joy of “The Echo Mocks the Corncrake” (Sawyers, 1996, p. 56-57).*

Robert Burns would often write in a dialect known as light Scots; this is notable because, due to the Scottish Enlightenment, earlier scholars had rejected this dialect in favor of a more educated sounding language such as English (Kay, 2012). Burns’ use of this dialect in his poems helped revived its usage, and his anglicized, simplified version of the dialect made his poems accessible in countries where audiences were not familiar with this vernacular, while still vigorously referencing Scottish culture. This accessibility is demonstrated by the international popularity of poems that include light Scots such as “Auld Lang Syne.” Mary Ellen Brown suggests,

*Burns might be called a savior of folksongs because in the words of many commentators, he “rescued” old wrecks of Scottish culture and save them, often by editing and making hitherto unprintable songs, printable; in this sense he might be called a popularizer, preparing the songs for that collection of popular taste, The Scots Musical Museum (Brown, 1984).*

The extensive use of Robert Burns’ expressions in his music in turn made Andy M. Stewart’s renditions similarly accessible. The novelty of Scottish folk music in a new form made Andy popular internationally and even locally once the contemporary ingredients were accepted and normalized. His pieces are still widely revered among the folk community, which was Stewart’s wish. He said “I suppose I’d like a legacy really of just being remembered fondly by whomever, my friends and the folk I left behind. It would be nice for them to remember me in a positive way. It would be nice for my songs to survive. It would be nice for my family. I’d like them to last.”

## CHAPTER II: EXONOSTALGIA

Derived from the Greek root *exo*, meaning ‘outside,’ both the term ‘exotic’ and ‘exonostalgia’ refer to matters outside of one’s own experience. That is, ‘exonostalgia’ stays true to its root, describing a form of nostalgia for events and situations outside of one’s own memory and life. However, despite containing the same root, ‘exotic’ has evolved into a new meaning. Coming to popularity in Britain in the sixteenth century, ‘exotic’ began to be understood as meaning anything that was not British; anything that contrasted with or stood out in the context of white, Western, British identity was branded as exotic. The term first was simply a synonym with foreign, but now, it is associated with distance and anything that particularly is out of the ordinary.

In an exploration of the increased consumption of ‘exotic’ food in Britain, author Jon May concluded that the people concerned were not typically seeking out a higher level of cultural awareness, but instead simply wished to be different, to seek an alternative lifestyle. In an interview, May said that “...she is attracted as much to vegetarianism as to Indian and Chinese cuisine, and the attraction of the latter is not that it is Chinese or Indian, but only that - like vegetarian food - it is different from more familiar, more traditional fare” (May, 1996, p. 62). May found that the central consumers of these exotic foods were a new “cultural class” of professionals leading gentrification while also often spearheading attempts to introduce and maintain cultural diversity in their workplaces. They are particularly drawn to the principle of being culturally diverse as “a way of distancing themselves from other social groups. This would suggest that, rather than articulating a genuine interest in other cultures, the new cultural class may be

consuming this food as a part of a quite different project, a project of social distinction” (59).

In a parallel referencing music, a conclusion could be drawn that the average person does not listen to Scottish folk music and artists because they have a well-rounded interest in Scottish culture, but because they are drawn to difference – to ‘exoticism.’ They are attracted by ideas that contrast with what is familiar in musical styles endemic to them. For example, Scottish peasant life is often presented as a romanticized repertoire of nostalgic, peaceful folk tunes in a manner known as ‘kailyard school.’ This specific treatment of and selection of music is often present in the works of Andy M. Stewart. This allows consumers of this musical style to enjoy music about bucolic lifestyle they likely have never experienced. In the case of Andy Stewart, the vibrant clothes and rousing music, often termed ‘tartanry,’ may give people “spice, seasoning that can liven up the dull dish that is mainstream white culture” (Hooks, 1992, p. 21).

In stark contrast, nostalgia towards a differing culture does not have to be viewed in such a negative, pessimistic light as does Jon May. The authenticity of local food production served in restaurants thought to be exotic allows restaurant-goers to feel a personal connection to these establishments; these restaurants are run by members of their communities who are also likely sourcing their ingredients from the general locale (Autio, Collins, Wahlen, & Anttila, 2013, p. 565). In an article discussing nostalgia in food consumption, Angelica Espinoza-Ortega states “nostalgia more than a desire to return home to the past; is the desire for an idealised past that leads to the consumption of nostalgia foods to mitigate the sense of loss (2021).” In the consumption of exotic food, loss being mitigated could be the sense of community and locality due to the

globalization of food production. Consumers could be searching for a coterie of foodies interested in a culture's palate whether they 'belong' to the culture or not; they are searching for their 'belonging' in a different manner, not as citizens of a particular country, but as a group attracted to the characteristics of a certain culture.

While Scottish folk music may not be produced locally by some populations with which it is popular with, the sense of community and belonging this music brings to those interested in it produces feelings of nostalgia. In preparation for this thesis, the primary investigator of this study attended a Celtic festival that was being held near to where she was living. In general, she noted that people did not seem to be there because the event was particularly Scottish or particularly Celtic, but because it was a family style event being held by and for the local community. The food, music, games, shops, and athletic events were all accessible to every age, gender, and creed who wanted to attend, learn, and enjoy. Due to this event, people could feel nostalgic through thoughts of Scotland and other Celtic regions; this is not only because they had a small taste of these cultures through this festival, but also because they were able to connect with their general community in a positive manner.

### **Exonostalgia Explored**

To understand exonostalgia, one must first be familiar with nostalgia innocent of any prefixes or suffixes. Stuart Tannock describes nostalgia as a contemporary Western concept; on the other hand, Manuel Menke delineates nostalgia as being a "universally human experience" (Tannock, 1995; Menke, 2017, p. 626.). Constantine Sedikides and Tim Wildschut, both professors of social and personality psychology at University of Southampton, write "nostalgia – defined as sentimental longing for one's past – is a self-



relevant, albeit deeply social, and an ambivalent, albeit more positive than negative, emotion. As nostalgia bring the past into present focus, it has existential implications” (Sedikides & Wildschut, 2018).

In an in-depth study of nostalgia, researchers found that occurrences that produce nostalgia are typically those where an individual is at the forefront of interactions with other people during momentous events; the feeling of nostalgia is triggered by negative emotions such as loneliness (Wildschut, Sedikides, Arndt, & Routledge, 2006). Despite being aroused by negative emotions, nostalgia is commonly associated with sanguinity as it can bolster self-confidence and social connectedness (Sedikides, Wildschut, Arndt, & Routledge, 2008). Michael Pickering and Emily Keightley at Loughborough University present a different perspective of nostalgia being a “conceptual opposite of progress, against which it is negatively viewed as reactionary, sentimental or melancholic” (Pickering & Keightley, 2006). In connection with music, nostalgia is an important positive factor for both musicians and listeners; musicians weave nostalgic triggers into their music, and listeners seek music that allow them to feel and remember these sentimental memories.

At the times when Andy Stewart and Andy M. Stewart were pursuing their separate careers in music, a shift in the nostalgic paradigm was occurring. With the introduction of television and other forms of mass media, people began forming and creating memories in new ways, leading to new forms of nostalgia. Fred Davis studied this “nostalgia wave” as it was happening.

*He found nostalgia in the 1970s to evolve differently from earlier forms of nostalgia. He recognized a shift in the landscape of nostalgia that formerly was*

*“inhabited mainly by persons, places, and events of political or civic character” to a landscape predominantly inhabited by “media creations, personalities, and allusions.” From now on, he stated, nostalgia mostly became a dwelling on “media celebrities, old movies, TV shows, popular music styles, and dated speech mannerisms.” Davis traced this new predominance of mass-mediated nostalgia back to an increasing pervasiveness of mass media and their new prominent role in people’s “mental lives” (Menke, 2017, p. 627).*

It was also around this time that exonostalgia itself became prevalent; many people were being introduced to places, people, and experiences they had never encountered personally, these introductions made through media consumption. At the same time, this period of tumultuous change in culture had people reaching for comforting familiarities of the past (Menke, 2017, p. 627). Perhaps this is why folk and traditional musicians became so popular at this time; they were performing conventional music that some individuals had remembered and some not – musics still novel in many ways, such as Andy Stewart’s tartanry on international television and Andy M. Stewart’s willingness to alter established music and his introduction of electric instruments into his pieces. Both men offered unstressful amelioration of the ongoing monumental cultural transition.

Minju Han and George E. Newman discuss a phenomenon they termed communal nostalgia in which people acquire items from a past with which they do not have personal connections. In this paper, these analysts give the example of someone buying a record, even though they grew up with a different form of music consumption such as mp3 files or cassette tapes. However, the bestselling contemporary records are from present-day

artists rather than from artists who were popular when this consumption style was newly in fashion (Han & Newman, 2022). This suggests that in times of dramatic change – i.e., the 1960s and 2008s, which is being discussed in the aforesaid paper – a community will latch onto items or people that convey permanence (Han & Newman, 2022).

Another type of relevant nostalgia is historical nostalgia; this differs from personal nostalgia because it stems from sentimentalities about the past beyond the individuals living memory (Kim, 2005). The two can be differentiated as such – personal nostalgia refers to the ‘way *I* was’ and historical nostalgia refers to the ‘way *it* was’ (Marchegiani & Phau, 2007, p. 2000). In a survey of nostalgia, Batcho was found that historical nostalgia caused people to empathize at a higher level with unhappy, sorrowful lyrics; the opposite was found for personal nostalgia where individuals found more meaning and felt strongly connected to happy lyrics (Batcho, 2007). Moving further, historical nostalgia could also refer to an event that a person lived through but did not experience personally.

*These memories are a combination of tales of the unexperienced past and the experiences of hearing these reminiscences. With the advent of motion pictures, televisions, sound recording, and radio, depictions of past events need no longer rely on verbal descriptions and can be much more vivid, imparting a sense of actual participation in an event or era... Again, music is a key theme in the nostalgic experience, as well as the classic filtering (looking at the past through rose-colored glasses) which occurs when one reminisces: ...When I hear the music that came from that time period [Woodstock], it makes me nostalgic for an idealized past (that wasn't really ideal). I think of a time period when people*

*stepped out of the tight social structure, broke some (narrowly conceived) rules, and made history (Holak & Havlena, 1992).*

Historical nostalgia would be considered a form of exonostalgia; people are reminiscing about certain events, items, or people that they themselves have not experienced personally. Whether these are dated in or out of their lifespan, they establish meaningful connection to it for a multitude of reasons; somewhere along the way, Andy Stewart and Andy M. Stewart found themselves inspiring all these nostalgia types, gathered up into what could be called heritage tourism. The National Trust for Historic Preservation describes heritage tourism as “traveling to experience the places, artifacts, and activities that authentically represent the stories and people of the past and present.” Scholars look at heritage tourism in a more nuanced and subjective manner rather than an objective lens into a certain culture; heritage tourism is a circumstance of demand from tourists (Poria, Butler, & Airey, 2003, p. 240). A thorough study found a large number of purveyors of heritage tourism were those who perceived these cultural sites as personally connected to them through their own heritage; at the same time, many of the tourists at this site had no personal connection but wished to experience ‘the past’ while also enjoying entertainment, relaxation, and shopping (Poria, Butler, & Airey, 2003, p. 249).

In the cases of Andy Stewart and Andy M. Stewart, heritage tourists did not have to travel to experience these cultures – the ‘heritage sites’ came to them instead. Whether through international tours where fans could enjoy this music or through radio, TV, or other media consumption, those with or without personal connections to the culture the two Stewarts championed were able to see what they may have considered to be

authentically Scottish performances. Individuals who consider Scottish folk and traditional music as part of their heritage – likely through ancestry – would associate heavy personal connections and meanings with the performances; those who did not consider Scottish music as their heritage would be drawn in by the kitsch novelty and the cultural exoticism of the performance, through their listening creating new memories which could then be revised within the multifaceted lens of nostalgia.

Leading into a more in-depth discussion of the term *exonostalgia*, it is important to note that David Berliner is also describing what was considered above as historical nostalgia – “...nostalgia for a past not experienced personally, a vicarious nostalgia that I would term ‘*exonostalgia*’, which encompasses discourses about loss detached from the direct experience of losing something personal, nonetheless triggering a whole array of affects such as indignation, anger or pain” (Berliner, 2014, p. 376). The context in which this quote was said offers a large differential though; throughout the paper in which David Berliner introduces this term, he is focused heavily on culture, ethnography, and anthropology. This would suggest that *exonostalgia* is a term that more specifically describes nostalgia for a *cultural* past not personally experienced.

This is demonstrated through many of the anecdotes and examples Berliner uses throughout his analysis; Berliner writes about French philosopher Barbara Cassin of Hungarian-Jewish descent who felt close personal ties to Corsica despite having no connections to the island (Berliner, 2014, p. 375). He also states that the first ethnographies, observational, immersive research of cultures, were steeped with a “longing for disappearing exotic societies” (Berliner, 2014, p. 374). Even pioneers of modern anthropology such as Franz Boas were not exempt from the draw of ‘forgotten’

cultures – Berliner termed this ‘disciplinary exnostalgia’ (Berliner, 2014, p. 374). He details how these works became ‘cultural obituaries,’ because they were going into the field with the mindset that these cultures (i.e. Zambia, Native Americans, Aboriginal Australians) were fading due to Western ethnocide and were prejudiced with the idea that nothing could save these cultures, so all they could do is record them for posterity (Berliner, 2014, p. 376-377).

Moving away from the ethnographic associations, Berliner also discusses how tourists can experience forms of exnostalgia.

*Appadurai has coined the word ‘armchair nostalgia’ to describe such vicarious yearning for the past, reminiscent of ‘that nostalgia for an unknown land’ ...*

*Nowadays, the latter attitude is common among Western tourists whose externalist discourses about cultural loss do not refer to their own historical past.*

*During my research in Luang Prabang (in Lao PDR), I remember hearing three*

*Dutch tourists in front of a Buddhist temple who exclaimed with a disappointed tone: ‘It’s a shame. Locals do not even wear their traditional clothes anymore.*

*Too bad. It is too late.’ Is this an expression of nostalgia? I think so. Although*

*vicarious and lower in emotional intensity, such an exclamation carries with it the*

*idea of regret for a world imagined as disappearing, the feeling of losing*

*something important (Berliner, 2014, p. 375).*

It is in this description of armchair nostalgia that Andy Stewart and Andy M. Stewart can be considered. Certainly not every purveyor of their music seeks it out due to interest specifically in the decline of Celtic culture, but many stick around due to this; they are feeling that longing for the “disappearing exotic societies.” At the same time, the

lyrics would, for the international listeners, elicit feelings of exonostalgia about a country and culture they have not truly experienced themselves while the performers may be feeling both endonostalgia and exonostalgia at the same time. Andy Stewart and Andy M. Stewart occasionally sing about events and times they were not a part of, but the song may be personally connected to their memories and sentimentality.

Particularly in the case of Andy Stewart, international viewers may be drawn to his bright visual representation of Scotland; the culture is tangible even through a screen through use of his Highland dancing, tartan Scottish garb including a kilt, and, through *The White Heather Club*, ceilidhs. Non-Scottish viewers may herald him as a protector of a dissipating culture.

*Broadly speaking, one can treat nostalgia as a specific posture vis-a`-vis the past seen as irreversible, a set of publicly displayed discourses, practices and emotions where the ancient is somehow glorified and considered lost forever, without necessarily implying the experience of first-hand memories. Such vicariousness goes as far as to be lamenting the vanishing of other people's past and culture (Berliner, 2014, p. 375).*

Berliner sums it up well here; many listeners experiencing specifically exonostalgia – sentimental feelings about a cultural past they have never experienced – when listening to the Stewarts indirectly or directly mourn the perceived loss of culture in the originating country, Scotland. This is not to say that international non-Scottish listeners of these two artists can only experience exonostalgia and cultural loss. Particularly in the time periods they were popular when countries such as the United States were experiencing serious cultural shift, listeners may have latched onto Andy

Stewart and Andy M. Stewart as permanent, unchanging relics that allow them to feel more steadfast and elicit nostalgia of an unchanged past.



### **CHAPTER III: TARTANRY AND KAILYARD SCHOOL**

Tartanry and kailyard school are both conventions used to romanticize Scotland. Although vastly different in concept, the devices describe literature, songs, and other media that glamorize and stereotype Scotland and Scottish culture. The two approaches often intertwine, particularly in music, and can easily trigger nostalgia regardless of how they are mixed. Tartanry is associated with the Highlands whereas kailyard school is associated with the lowlands. Margaret Waterbury writes that “the distinction between Highland and Lowland Scotland is rooted in a complex history, and extended along geographic, linguistic, and even cultural dimensions (Waterbury, 2022).

The Highlands is the “rugged and isolated” country that we typically see in nationalistic Scottish movies, for example *Braveheart* and *Skyfall*; this is where the deep-rooted clans are located, and from this area stems the romantic device of tartanry (Waterbury, 2022). In simplification, tartanry refers to a kitsch, fatuous stereotype of Scotland (Brown, 1984). Contrastingly, the Lowlands offer a more genteel landscape of agriculture and pastures; from this area stems kailyard school, a device that idealizes a somewhat rough, pastoral life and land (Waterbury, 2022; Lhotova, 2011). In the same way that tartanry belongs with the Highlands and kailyard school belongs with the Lowlands, these two approaches are assigned to the two Stewarts; Andy Stewart is strongly linked to tartanry, and Andy M. Stewart’s songs are associated with kailyard school.

#### **Tartanry and Andy Stewart**

Once standard working clothes, the kilt and the tartan have become beloved

Scottish icons. Stuart Reid, a Scottish historical writer, likens them to German *lederhosen* and even Texan cowboy shirts in his book *Scottish National Dress and Tartan*; these items are an observable expression of identity, culture, and history (2013, p. 5). While now seen as a positive cultural representation of Scotland, it was not too long ago that the wearing of tartan was illegal and viewed as mutinous, especially by a colonizing Britain. This tumultuous relationship with tartan developed into a vehement local identification with the material.

The characteristic plaid design of the tartan worked well for a mutinous people looking for a symbol of unity and rebellion against British tyranny. During the Jacobite Rising in 1745, an edict by Lord Lewis Gordon required his new recruits to own plaid garments (regardless of color) among other items; other officers followed suit and required the same of their own men (Agis, 2014, p. 3). This led to an inexpensive, identifiable uniform that was distinguishable against the red of British uniforms. Intent on Scottish independence, Scottish soldiers flaunted their tartan and kilts as a symbol of their culture and identity and used them as a political symbol. This led to the British government decreeing a disarming act (previously used to ban the use of certain weapons) prohibiting the presenting of any distinctly Scottish garb such as kilts and tartan:

*Abolition and Proscription of the Highland Dress*

*19 George II, Chap. 39, Sec. 17, 1746*

*That from and after the first day of August, One thousand, seven hundred and forty-seven, no man or boy within that part of Britain called Scotland, other than such as shall be employed as Officers and Soldiers in His Majesty's Forces, shall,*

*on any pretext whatever, wear or put on the clothes commonly called Highland clothes (that is to say) the Plaid, Philabeg, or little Kilt, Trowse, Shoulder-belts, or any part whatever of what peculiarly belongs to the Highland Garb: and that no tartan or pary-coloured plaid of stuff shall be used for Great Coats or upper coats, and if any such person shall presume after the said first day of August, to wear or put on the aforesaid garment or any part of them, every such person so offending... shall be liable to be transported to any of His Majesty's plantations beyond the seas, there to remain for the space of seven years.*

This act allowed the wearing of tartan to move from being primarily a symbol of the Highlands to being generally Scottish (Milne, 2010, p. 138). The act was repealed in 1782 after Scottish and British relationships began to evolve into one as equals rather than one of superiority. Even so, regiments loyal to the British crown such as Hugh Montgomerie's West Lowland Fencibles from Ayrshire and his Royal Glasgow Regiment still wanted to be viewed as "ostentatiously" Scottish, and donned Highland clothes such as kilts and tartan patterns as their uniforms (Reid, p. 2013).

The resurgence of the popularity of tartan only arrived when King George IV visited Scotland in 1822; drawn to the country by Sir Walter Scott's glamorization of Scottish nationalism through his writing and storytelling, the King also donned tartan during the visit (Milne, 2010, p. 138). Seeing that tartan was accepted by the British crown led to a major inflation in the production and wearing of tartan; mills struggled to keep up with the multitude of frantic requests leading to new methods of recording tartan production and patterns and thus establishing "clan tartans." During this time, certain colors and modern tartans were produced into "dress tartans" that were aimed towards

women; this gave rise to a much more widespread popularity of tartan (139). It was no longer viewed as just for men but could be used as a symbol of identity by an entire country.

Interestingly, the emergence of tartanry as a common device or trope also coincides with tartan becoming scrutinized in its home country. Scottish citizens felt as if their culture had become objectified by the material; rather than being known for a rich, diverse culture and country with deep history, Scotland was beginning to be reduced to a cliché characterized by a tartan pattern and bagpipes (Brown, 2010, p. 83). However, the rejection of this pattern from its origin corresponds to an embrace of it internationally. An expanding Scottish-American identity found the first Tartan Day being celebrated in 1997, and with this came an ever-growing number of CelticFests and Highland games, at which an exorbitant number of participants wear kilts to highlight their Scottish identity (Brown, 2010, p. 85).

The use of kilts in this context is immediately questionable; it contrasts harshly against the purpose of kilts in Scottish culture as formal attire. This suggests that, to adopters of the Scottish-American identity, wearing kilts is not a task meant to preserve Scottish culture but one that allows a tangible, highly visible display of identity. Despite this, many Scottish-Americans are under the viewpoint that they *are* the safeguards of this culture, with one such quoted saying “You have to come to America to see how we protect the Highland heritage, because you fail to do it sufficiently in Scotland” (Brown, 2010, p. 85). This clash between an authentic Scotland and a spurious Scottish identity leads to total rejection of any stereotyped objects by Scottish citizens, especially if they are being objectified by non-Scots.

Tartantry describes what scholars would think of as a debased version of Scottish culture; it describes anything that is stereotypically Scottish – tartan, kilts, whiskey, bagpipes, haggis, and even myths and legends such as the Loch Ness Monster or Greyfriars Bobby (Davidson, 1999). Of course, all these items were particularly Scottish, but when they began to be objectified and used as crude, exclusive representations of the culture by citizens and foreigners alike, criticism arose. Richard Dyer, a Professor of Film Studies, denounced what was once termed ‘Scottish-ism’ and “bemoaned the emptiness of all this Tartantry, jokes about sporrans and haggis, the whining bagpipes and accordion bands, the same old songs dragged out time and time again” (Williamson, 2021, p. 19).

It is likely that Andy Stewart donned the kilt for the first time on *The White Heather Club* in celebration of a television show that, to him, felt authentically Scottish. The show was built upon bothy ballads, another uniquely Scottish genre, and was in the style of a ceilidh, a Celtic singsong and dance party; it is natural that the next step into making the show more Scottish was to introduce cultural garments. Andy Stewart already had achieved musical popularity in Scotland; when *The White Heather Club* began to be broadcast into the UK, his kilt and general tartantry were suddenly paradigmatic of Scotland and Scottish culture (Williamson, 2021, p. 19).

*Tom Nairn wrote in 1977 of how culture in Scotland had become ‘curiously fixed or fossilized on the level of the image of d’Epinal and Auld Lang Syne, of the Scott Monument, Andy Stewart and The Sunday Post – to the point of forming a huge, virtually self-contained universe of kitsch’, something characterized by Beveridge and Turnbull as Scottish inferiorism: an acceptance of Scottish life and culture as being ‘inferior to metropolitan styles’ (Williamson, 2021, p. 19).*

Certainly, Andy Stewart did not intend to disparage his culture when he donned his kilt on live television; his job was to capture attention and to retain viewers, and he did so by being bright and gimmicky. However, viewers outside of Scotland observed this novel display of culture as representative, and Scottish culture was suddenly pigeonholed into one of garishness. This is supported by BBC's description of the show on their website.

*Andy Stewart presented and sang in the Scottish country dance and music show which, at its peak, drew in an audience of 10 million and turned Stewart into an international star. This very Scottish image, awash with kilts and fiddles, is one which the rest of the network took to be a true representation of Scotland (Brown, 2005).*

These caricatures of culture were merely dramatic techniques employed to help viewers swiftly associate *The White Heather Club* with Scotland; it is apparent, however, that the show was not meant to be taken seriously, particularly given Andy Stewart's expertise creating comedic impressions.

The discussion as to why this portrayal of Scottish culture was so earnestly accepted moves the dialogue back into the realm of nostalgia. Close to home in Scotland, the music and tartanized aspect of the show could illicit communal nostalgia. With the introduction of the television into the country, individuals were suddenly exposed to cultures and ideas they were not previously familiar with; the traditional and folk Scottish songs on television along with recognizable symbols such as tartan kilts gave the country objects of permanence to latch onto. They were consuming established media (the songs and clothing) in a contemporary manner, similar to the example of the public buying

records from present-day artists. Using innovative technology to consume earlier media simply switches the idea of using old technology to consume new media.

To viewers in the UK or internationally, Andy Stewart and *The White Heather Club* could evoke exonostalgia or historical nostalgia in people who do not have personal connections to the Scottish culture, and even those who do. Nonnative Scots who closely tie their identity to Scottishness could find themselves being sentimental and nostalgic about their conceived notions on Scotland's prior cultural prime; they never experienced this alleged societal heyday themselves, but their artificial idea of it brings forth strong emotions. This would closely relate to historical nostalgia or 'the way *it* used to be.'

Nonpartisan viewers, neither native nor nonnative Scots, can also establish deep personal connections to Andy Stewart and *The White Heather Club* that would evoke nostalgia. In this case, it would be an example of exonostalgia; these individuals are experiencing strong emotions to a culture they have never directly experienced. The establishment of television as a common household item gave these viewers the opportunity to observe presumed authenticity, and they established relationships with the culture as if they had experienced it in Scotland itself. No matter who experienced it or what type of nostalgia was evoked, it is unquestionable that the tartanry was at least a partial trigger for it.

### **Kailyard School and Andy M. Stewart**

Kailyard school is mostly commonly known and referred to as a literary device. However, considering that music also employs written word, it is reasonable to use it in a musical context as well. This term is derived from Scottish kale yards which date back as far as the 1500s and even further (Grant, 2021). The winter climate of Scotland was

suitable for kale to prosper, making it a staple for peasants and their animals (Stephen, 2022). In the late 1800s when romanticization of this homestead life in literature was rampant, kailyard was coined to deride these bucolic retellings of rustic strife (Walton, 2015).

It is in the discourse about the origin of the kailyard way of writing that the nationalist poet Robert Burns re-emerges.

*Kailyard fiction is seen here as descending directly, not specifically from Burn's poetry, but from the identification of that poetry as the meaning of Scotland. I have argued in detail elsewhere that in the nineteenth century "The Cotter's Saturday Night," Burn's then most famous poem, became the canonical image of Scottish life, helping to promote an emphasis on rural and humble life as representative of Scottish national identity. This image of "the lowly train in life's sequestered scene," with the "toil-worn cotter" returning home from a cold November day to join his contended family in a meal and a reading from the Bible, is celebrated in the poem by one of Burns's most famous lines: "From scenes like these, old Scotia's grandeur springs". To Burns's critics the word "old" was unnecessary. As early as 1793 this poem was being presented as a realistic presentation of life in Scotland (Nash, 2007, p. 23).*

In the same way Andy Stewart and *The White Heather Club* were unexpectedly representative of a complete Scottish culture, many years before, Robert Burns and his works were found in the same position. Although it is unlikely that his poems were meant to romanticize rural life rather than simply telling a story, the acceptance of this frame of reference made this viewpoint canon to many people who were unfamiliar with this



lifestyle or who had fond memories of such situations; this became particularly prominent when this genre became increasingly popular in Britain (Maume, 2016, p. 122). Once more, an incomplete picture of Scotland became representative of the entire country to British (and other international) readers.

Comparable to Andy Stewart using tartanry as a performance device in *The White Heather Club*, Andy M. Stewart uses kailyard as a device in his lyrics. In a discussion of Andy Stewart's love songs, JS Sawyers writes "to native Scots such language reflects the sentimental attachment that they have toward the familiar national images, such as the bonny Highland laddie who inhabits a pastoral paradise of bens and lochs" (1996, p. 49-50). Sawyers continues in that vein, noting that this idealized portrayal of Scotland is particularly alluring to "non-Scots and diaspora Scots" who have an altered concept of Scotland (1996, p. 50). This observation relates to nostalgia and its triggers; listeners are experiencing strong emotions about this music whether they have direct experiences with its subject or not.

In contrast to Robert Burns, however, Andy Stewart does not write about events or stories that could be romanticized or used to generalize the Scottish culture. Instead, Andy Stewart uses the already apotheosized image of Scotland to write his lyrics; he plays into this modified perception and capitalizes upon it (Sawyers, 1996, p. 50).

*Stewart has reinvented Scotland, but in a slightly different way, by filtering traditional Scottish imagery through a modern eye. He is very much aware of the attitude of both his predecessors and his contemporaries. Consequently, he is just as able and willing as anyone to simplify the past and the portray complex history in broad strokes, such as when he described the Highlands as a land "where once*

*smiled the gardens” and idealizes the “gallant and brave” Highlanders as “the gentle inhabitants of Gaeldom.” Yet his sincerity is rarely questioned... His original compositions may include images that we have come to associate with Scotland – misty mountains, noble fighters, hard-working men and long-suffering lassies, “scholars and great drinkers” – but in subtle ways he lets the audience know that he is in on it too (Sawyers, 1996, p. 51).*

Andy M. Stewart is different from Andy Stewart in that he purposefully draws upon these romantic stereotypes in his music; Andy Stewart inadvertently embodied a tartan iconography. While Andy Stewart did purposefully accentuate the Scottishness of his performances, his intention was never to be representative of the culture. Andy M. Stewart took an already prevalent belief about his country and culture and used it to his advantage in his songs. He took an already representative idea and used it to give his performances edge.

For an example of kailyard in a song of Andy M. Stewart’s, one can examine a popular love song of his, ‘The Valley of Strathmore.’ Throughout the piece, charming and quaint descriptions of the terrain are offered in verses such as “by the clear and the winding stream” and “from the glen of the golden and the green I left for a land far away.” While these lyrics on their own may not do much to influence an opinion, these depictions of an indistinguishable, flawless Scotland found in a plethora of literary works and songs are enough for a consumer to make a reasonable assumption that this is an accurate representation of Scotland and Scottish culture.

Moving back to nostalgia, kailyard school goes hand in hand with historical nostalgia – how *it* was. Scottish people are directly impacted by rose-colored depictions

of their culture's past; kailyard deploys the fondest memories and the prettiest pictures to offer the reader or listener contentment in their culture – or their culture's past. In comparison to these representations, their life now is less than idyllic and certainly not as satisfying or memorable. Even if a Scottish person were to spend his or her entire life in an urban setting, the portrayal of a previously utterly rural country would elicit strong emotions and bring forth nostalgia for a life they have never experienced. As Sawyers expresses "Quite often the land left behind is remembered in rosy and picturesque terms, a simpler place that the emigrants were forced to leave because of circumstances beyond their control (Sawyers, 1996, p. 52).

The idealization of Scottish rural life also lures in non-Scottish readers and listeners. As previously stated, these representations are attractive to foreigners because they align with their willful perception of a perfect Scotland. Unlike someone who lives in Scotland, one who would be aware that life certainly was not as idyllic as portrayed (though they certainly do not mind remembering it as such), non-Scots with no personal experience with the country may accept this rosy picture as valid. This leads into exonostalgia; these images of Scotland evoke strong emotions about a culture they have no experience with. Kindred to tartanry, kailyard school is also a trigger for nostalgia.

Moving beyond the often dour but modestly alluring portrayals of Scotland in music by primary revivalist Ewan MacColl, the two Stewarts built careers based on more positive impressions of their culture and nostalgic uses of Scottish music. Their artistry, in each case channeled to fit their own times, portrayed Scotland in comforting and entertaining ways. Listeners were drawn to their music through the use of these nostalgic

devices and triggers. Finally, the separate ways they accomplished this help us better understand exnostalgia.

## REFERENCES

- Agis, F. D. (2014). *Main Characteristics of the Scottish Jacobite Army from 1745 through 1746: Discussion Topic: Main Characteristics of the Scottish Jacobite Army between 1745 and 1746*. Lulu Press, Inc.
- “Andy M. Stewart.” (2016) *Compass Records*,  
<https://compassrecords.com/artist/andy-m-stewart/>.
- Autio, M., Collins, R., Wahlen, S., & Anttila, M. (2013). Consuming nostalgia? The appreciation of authenticity in local food production. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 37(5), 564-568.
- Batcho, K. I. (2007). Nostalgia and the emotional tone and content of song lyrics. *The American journal of psychology*, 120(3), 361-381.
- Berliner, D. (2014). On exonostalgia. *Anthropological theory*, 14(4), 373-386.
- Brown, I. (2005). In exile from ourselves?. Tartanry, Scottish popular theatre, Harry Lauder and Tartan Day. *Études écossaises*, (10), 123-141.
- Brown, I. (Ed.). (2010). *From tartan to tartanry: Scottish culture, history and myth*. Edinburgh University Press.
- Brown, M. E. (1984). *Burns and tradition*. Springer.
- Carnahan, D. (2020) “How Scottish Songs Came to America.” *Stringletter's Musical Traveler*, <https://musicaltraveler.com/stories/how-scottish-songs-came-to-america2/#:~:text=America's%20appetite%20for%20traditional%20ballads,perceived%20by%20Americans%20as%20folky>.
- Caswell, G. (2012). Beyond words: Some uses of music in the funeral setting. *OMEGA-Journal of Death and Dying*, 64(4), 319-334.

- Davidson, N. (1999). In Perspective: Tom Nairn. *International Socialism*, 82, 97-136.
- Espinoza-Ortega, A. (2021). Nostalgia in food consumption: Exploratory study among generations in Mexico. *International Journal of Gastronomy and Food Science*, 25, 100399.
- Foster, S. (2022). Start spreading the word.... *British Journal of Nursing*, 31(5), 297-297.
- Garrido, S., & Davidson, J. (2016). Emotional regimes reflected in a popular ballad: Perspectives on gender, love and protest in 'Scarborough Fair'. *Musicology Australia*, 38(1), 65-78.
- Grant, R. (2021, April 27). *500 years of Scottish garden history*. National Trust for Scotland. <https://www.nts.org.uk/stories/500-years-of-scottish-garden-history>
- Han, M., & Newman, G. E. (2022). Seeking Stability: Consumer Motivations for Communal Nostalgia. *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, 32(1), 77-86.
- Harris, S. (2012). "Andy Stewart - An Illustrated Record." *Andy Stewart - An Illustrated Record*, <https://andystewart.info/>.
- Holak, S. L., & Havlena, W. J. (1992). Nostalgia: An exploratory study of themes and emotions in the nostalgic experience. *ACR North American Advances*.
- Hooks, B. (1992). *Black Looks: Race and representation*, London: Turnaround.
- Hunt, K. (2016). Andy M Stewart: Acclaimed Folk Singer and Songwriter. *The Independent*, Independent Digital News and Media, <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/obituaries/andy-m-stewart-acclaimed-folk-singer-and-songwriter-who-made-his-name-as-a-member-of-the-muchloved-silly-wizard-a6824246.html>.
- Irving, G. (1993). Obituary: Andy Stewart." *The Independent*, Independent Digital News

and Media, <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/people/obituary-andy-stewart-1510366.html>.

Jackson, R. (2017). 15 famous songs every Scot will know. *The Scotsman*.

Kay, B. (2012). *Scots: The mither tongue*. Random House.

Kim, H. (2005). Research note: Nostalgia and tourism. *Tourism Analysis*, 10(1), 85-88.

Kowal, B. (2007). "Radio Station CHUM (Toronto) Weekly Charts for

1961." *Barry Kowal Hits of All Decades*,

[http://hitsofalldecades.com/chart\\_hits/index.php?option=com\\_content&task=view&id=853&Itemid=52](http://hitsofalldecades.com/chart_hits/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=853&Itemid=52).

Lhotová, M. (2011). *Kailyard and Tartanry-Cultural Nationalism in Scottish Literature at the Turn of 19th and 20th century* (Doctoral dissertation, MA thesis. Palacký University Olomouc).

Livingstone, S., & Bovill, M. (1999). Young people, new media: report of the research project Children Young People and the Changing Media Environment.

Marchegiani, C., & Phau, I. (2007). Remembering the way it was?: development and validation of the historical nostalgia scale. In *Proceedings of the Australian and New Zealand Marketing Academy Conference 2007* (pp. 2000-2008). University of Otago.

Maume, P. (2016). Hubert Quinn, liberal Protestantism and late kailyard culture in mid-twentieth-century Ulster. *Studia Hibernica*, 121-140.

May, J. (1996). 'A little taste of something more exotic': The imaginative geographies of everyday life. *Geography*, 57-64.

McKerrell, S. (2011). Modern Scottish Bands (1970-1990): Cash as

- Authenticity. *Scottish music review*, 2(1).
- Menke, M. (2017). Seeking comfort in past media: Modelling media nostalgia as a way of coping with media change. *International Journal of Communication*, 11, 21.
- Milne, N. C. (2010). *Scottish Culture and Traditions*. Paragon Publishing
- Munro, A. (1991). The Role of the School of Scottish Studies in the Folk Music Revival. *Folk Music Journal*, 6(2), 132-168.
- Munro, B. (1977, April). The Bothy Ballads: the social context and meaning of the farm servants' songs of North-Eastern Scotland. In *History Workshop* (pp. 184-193). Editorial Collective, History Workshop, Ruskin College.
- Nash, A. (2007). *Kailyard and Scottish literature* (Vol. 8). Rodopi.
- Pickering, M., & Keightley, E. (2006). The modalities of nostalgia. *Current sociology*, 54(6), 919-941.
- Pollock, D. (2016). Obituary: Andy M Stewart, Singer and Songwriter. *The Scotsman*, The Scotsman, <https://www.scotsman.com/news/obituaries/obituary-andy-m-stewart-singer-and-songwriter-1997406>.
- Purslow, F. (1975). *Songs of the Open Road*.
- Reid, S. (2013). *Scottish National Dress and Tartan*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Samuel, R. (1990, April). Ewan MacColl, 1915-1989. In *History Workshop* (pp. 216-222). Oxford University Press.
- Sawyers, J. S. (1996). Faithful Hearts and Gentle Lovers; The Romantic Impulse in the Songs of Andy M. Stewart. *International Review of Scottish Studies*, 21.
- Sedikides, C., Wildschut, T., Arndt, J., & Routledge, C. (2008). Nostalgia: Past, present, and future. *Current directions in psychological science*, 17(5), 304-307.



- Sedikides, C., & Wildschut, T. (2018). Finding meaning in nostalgia. *Review of General Psychology*, 22(1), 48-61.
- “Silly Wizard Biography”. (n.d.). NetIndustries. Retrieved April 26, 2022, from <https://musicianguide.com/biographies/1608003226/Silly-Wizard.html>
- Spicer, M. (2017). (Ac) cumulative Form in Pop-Rock Music. In *Rock Music* (pp. 295-330). Routledge.
- Stephen, P. (2022). *March*. Scotland Food and Drink. Retrieved April 28, 2022, from <https://foodanddrink.scot/resources/seasonality-calendar/months/march/#:%7E:text=Kale-Once%20the%20peasant%20winter%20staple%20producing%20food%20for%20the%20farmer,kale%20last%20and%20for%20longest.>
- Tannock, S. (1995). Nostalgia critique. *Cultural studies*, 9(3), 453-464.
- Uchida, M., & Coppola, M. Scottish traditional music.
- Walton, S. (2015). Scottish modernism, kailyard fiction and the woman at home. In *Transitions in Middlebrow Writing, 1880–1930* (pp. 141-160). Palgrave Macmillan, London.
- Waterbury, M. (2022, January 4). *What's the difference between Highland and Lowland Scotch?* The Whiskey Wash. Retrieved April 28, 2022, from <https://thewhiskeywash.com/whiskey-styles/scotch-whiskey/whats-difference-highland-lowland-scotch/>
- Wildschut, T., Sedikides, C., Arndt, J., & Routledge, C. (2006). Nostalgia: content, triggers, functions. *Journal of personality and social psychology*, 91(5), 975.
- Williamson, J. (2021). The kilt is my delight? Popular music on early television from

Scotland. *The Journal of Popular Television*, 9(1), 105-122.